Participation, characteristics and retention rates of HIV-positive immigrants in the Swiss HIV Cohort Study*

C Thierfelder,1 R Weber,1 L Elzi,2 H Furrer,3 M Cavassini,4 A Calmy,5 E Bernasconi,6 C Gutmann,7 B Ledergerber1 and the Swiss HIV Cohort Study Group

1Division of Infectious Diseases and Hospital Epidemiology, University Hospital Zurich, University of Zurich, Zurich, Switzerland, 2Division of Infectious Diseases and Hospital Epidemiology, University Hospital Basel, Basel, Switzerland, 3Clinic for Infectious Diseases, Bern University Hospital and University of Bern, Bern, Switzerland, 4University Hospital Lausanne, Lausanne, Switzerland, 5University Hospital Geneva, Geneva, Switzerland, 6Regional Hospital Lugano, Lugano, Switzerland and 7Catonal Hospital St Gallen, St Gallen, Switzerland

Objective
Data from observational cohorts may be influenced by population structure and loss to follow-up (LTFU). Quality of care may be associated with participation in cohort networks. We aimed to study the participation, characteristics and retention rates of immigrants in the Swiss HIV Cohort Study (SHCS).

Methods
We compared enrolment over time (1996–1999, 2000–2003 and 2004–2008) and LTFU between individuals from different geographical regions. In 2008, we performed a cross-sectional survey to investigate the proportion of individuals not participating in the SHCS but who were in care at SHCS institutions. Predictors for LTFU were analysed using Cox proportional hazard models, and those for nonparticipation using logistic regression.

Results
A total of 7840 individuals entered the SHCS during the observation period. The proportion of immigrants increased over time, especially the proportion of women from sub-Saharan Africa, which increased from 21 to 48% during the observation period. Overall LTFU was 3.76 [95% confidence interval (CI) 3.58–3.95]/100, with the highest hazard ratio in men from sub-Saharan Africa (2.82/100 patient-years; 95% CI 2.30–3.46/100), compared with men from northwestern countries. Other predictors for LTFU were age < 30 years, lower education, injecting drug use, and higher baseline CD4 cell counts. Participants taking antiretroviral therapy had reduced LTFU. The survey showed that 84% of HIV-infected patients in care at SHCS institutions were enrolled in the cohort. Nonparticipation was more likely among men from non-European regions (odds ratio 2.73; 95% CI 2.29–3.24), women from sub-Saharan Africa (odds ratio 3.01; 95% CI 2.40–3.77) and women from Latin America/Caribbean (odds ratio 2.10; 95% CI 1.30–3.39).

Conclusions
Numbers of HIV-infected immigrants are increasing but they are underrepresented in the SHCS, and immigrants are more likely to be lost to follow-up.

Keywords: cohort study, gender, HIV infection, immigrants, loss to follow-up, participation, sub-Saharan Africa

Accepted 28 June 2011

*See Appendix.

Introduction
World-wide, there are an estimated 214 million international migrants, comprising 3.1% of the global population [1]. Migrants and mobile people are increasingly recognized
as more vulnerable to HIV/AIDS than resident populations. They may also face greater obstacles in accessing medical care and social support, particularly if living with HIV or AIDS [2]. Currently, 22% of people living in Switzerland are foreign-born, with the percentage varying regionally and reaching up to 38% in the French-speaking urban areas of the country [3]. The majority of HIV-positive migrants from high-prevalence countries were infected in their home regions [4,5].

In Switzerland, the HIV epidemic mainly affected men who have sex with men (MSM) and injecting drug users (IDUs) in the 1980s. Since 1995, heterosexual contact has been the most frequent mode of HIV transmission (40% of all infections), and this has also been the case among immigrants. Data from the Swiss Federal Office of Public Health [6] and the Swiss HIV Cohort Study (SHCS) showed an increasing number of HIV-positive immigrants from high-prevalence countries at the beginning of the 21st Century [3,7].

HIV-positive persons with regular and unrestricted access to care have better health outcomes [8]. Between 70,000 and 180,000 undocumented immigrants are estimated to live in Switzerland [6]. Health insurance is compulsory and defined as a right for all residents, including undocumented people, in Switzerland. However, more than 90% of the undocumented migrants are estimated to have no health insurance [9].

Data from European HIV-infected cohorts indicate that migrants are prone to loss to follow-up (LTFU) [10,11], which may lead to loss of statistical power, bias in study results and lack of generalizability of study findings [12]. In contrast to other observational databases [11,13], the SHCS requires written informed consent which may pose a barrier to participation.

LTFU and participation have not been studied in previous research on immigrants in the SHCS [4,7]. Therefore, we aimed to study (i) the demographic and clinical characteristics, (ii) the time trends and (iii) the retention rates of cohort participants of different geographical origins. Furthermore, we quantified nonparticipation in the SHCS by means of a cross-sectional survey.

Methods

Cohort study

The SHCS was established in 1988 (www.shcs.ch) as a collaboration of seven specialized centres [14]. Since 1995, interested private physicians and regional hospitals have also collaborated. In 2008, 32% of SHCS participants were treated by private physicians. The study has been approved by local ethical committees and written informed consent is obtained from all participants. For this study, we selected all participants who entered the SHCS between 1 January 1996 and 31 December 2008.

Survey on nonparticipation in the cohort

The seven SHCS centres, 13 affiliated hospitals and 33 private collaborating physicians from all regions of the country were addressed in formal correspondence to provide aggregated (i.e. unidentifiable) numbers of HIV-positive persons not participating in the SHCS during their first clinical visit in 2008. Collected information included geographical region of origin, gender, injecting drug use (IDU) and whether the patient was on ART. After two rounds of reminders via email and/or telephone, the response rate was 40 of 53 (75%) clinics or private physicians, and those that responded included all seven SHCS centres and all large institutions providing HIV care.

Definitions

Among participants not known to have died, we defined LTFU as no further cohort visit during at least 1 year after the last visit.

We distinguished seven geographical regions of patients’ origin according to an adopted UNAIDS classification of nationalities [15]. Because of the small numbers of persons in care and their similar demographic characteristics, we merged the Caribbean and Latin America into one region and combined the USA, Canada, Australia and New Zealand with northwestern Europe. Thus, the regions were: (1) Northwestern countries (Switzerland, Andorra, Austria, Belgium, Denmark, Finland, France, Germany, the UK, Iceland, Ireland, Liechtenstein, Luxembourg, Monaco, the Netherlands, Norway, Sweden, USA, Canada, Australia and New Zealand); (2) sub-Saharan Africa; (3) Southern Europe (Spain, Portugal, Italy, Greece, Malta and San Marino); (4) Latin America/Caribbean; (5) Southeastern Asia; (6) Eastern Europe/Central Asia; and (7) Northern Africa/Middle East.

The SHCS collects information on ethnicity, categorized as White, Black, Asian and Hispano-American. Because there was a congruent picture between nationality and ethnicity in five out of the seven regions described above (>96% of participants), we did not analyse the data for ethnicity separately.

Data analyses

Demographic and clinical characteristics at inclusion were analysed for three calendar periods (1996–1999, 2000–2003 and 2004–2008) to determine trends over time. Cox proportional hazards models were fitted to examine the effects of region of origin, gender, age, education, IDU, clinical HIV disease stage and treatment status on the probability of ceasing to participate in the SHCS. CD4 cell count was also fitted as a time-updated covariable. Because
of evidence of an interaction [likelihood ratio test (LRT) \( P<0.001 \)] between region of origin and gender, we analysed the risk for LTFU separately for women and men.

Data from the survey on SHCS participation were analysed using logistic regression. Because the group of former participants was very small (3.7%), we decided to exclude them from the analysis and compare current participants vs. never participants. Because of evidence of an interaction between region of origin and gender (LRT \( P=0.016 \)), we calculated the odds of nonparticipation separately for men and women. Analyses were carried out using Stata software (version 11.2; StataCorp LP, College Station, TX, USA).

## Results

### Baseline demographic characteristics of SHCS participants

Between 1996 and 2008, 7840 participants were enrolled in the SHCS. Table 1 shows baseline characteristics stratified for region of origin: 67% of participants originated from northwestern regions, 14% from sub-Saharan Africa, 8% from southern Europe, 4% from Latin America/Caribbean, 3% from southeastern Asia, 2% from eastern Europe/Central Asia and 1% from northern Africa/Middle East. The gender composition varied considerably among the immigrant groups included. The proportion of women ranged from 17% in participants from southern Europe to 66% in participants from sub-Saharan Africa. Similarly, heterosexual transmission ranged from 31% in northwestern countries to 4, 3 and 1% in participants from southern Europe, Latin America/Caribbean and sub-Saharan Africa, respectively. Persons from sub-Saharan Africa and southeastern Asia were less likely to have completed mandatory school as compared with groups of other origin.

Participants from sub-Saharan African, southeastern Asia and eastern Europe/Central Asia showed a proportional increase in enrolment into the SHCS over time, while the
proportion of groups of other origin decreased. The most striking rise occurred in women from sub-Saharan Africa: in the last observation period, women from sub-Saharan Africa presented the largest group of all new enrollees (increasing from 19 to 42%). In men from sub-Saharan Africa, the increase was smaller (5.6 to 7.7%). Also in participants from southeastern Asia the increase in enrolment was more pronounced in women than in men, almost doubling from 1996–1999 to 2004–2008 (Fig. 1).

Clinical characteristics

On average, persons from sub-Saharan Africa, southern Europe and southeastern Asia enrolled with more advanced HIV infections than those from northwestern countries (Table 1). The most common opportunistic infection (OI) was Pneumocystis jiroveci pneumonia, which occurred in 6% of all participants. A history of tuberculosis (TB) was present in 2% of study participants; in 1% of those from northwestern countries and in 7% of those from sub-Saharan Africa. Participants from sub-Saharan Africa and southeastern Asia had the highest prevalence of active hepatitis B virus infection (9 and 10%, respectively). Serological evidence of past or present syphilis was found in 20% of participants from Latin America/Caribbean.

Retention in the cohort

A total of 1635 (20.9%) participants were lost to follow-up. The rate of LTFU was 3.76 [95% confidence interval (CI) 3.58–3.95]/100 person-years (py), ranging from 3.19 (95% CI 2.99–3.39)/100 py in participants from northwestern countries to 6.03 (95% CI 5.40–6.74)/100 py in participants from sub-Saharan Africa. Among participants from European countries, women were more likely to be lost to follow-up; in non-Europeans, men were more likely to be lost (Fig. 2). Of all subgroups, men from sub-Saharan Africa had the highest rate of LTFU, at 8.10 (95% CI 6.83–9.56)/100 py, a significantly higher rate than that for sub-Saharan Africa women, at 5.04 (95% CI 4.34–5.84)/100 py.

As shown in Table 2, all male migrant groups, with the exception of men from southern Europe, had a higher hazard of LTFU compared with those from northwestern regions; African men had the greatest hazard. In women, immigrants from sub-Saharan Africa, southern Europe and Latin America/Caribbean were more likely to be lost to follow-up. In both men and women, younger patients, and patients with less education, IDU and a higher CD4 cell count at baseline were more prone to LTFU. In contrast, in the time-updated analysis, participants with a higher latest CD4 cell count were less likely to be lost to follow-up:

---

Fig. 1 Enrolment of Swiss HIV Cohort Study (SHCS) participants over time by geographical region of origin and sex.

---

Fig. 2 Rates of loss to follow-up by geographical region of origin and sex. CI, confidence interval.
hazard ratios (HRs) were 0.63 (95% CI 0.53–0.74) in men and 0.64 (95% CI 0.50–0.82) in women. Being on ART at baseline was associated with a lower risk of LTFU. Neither calendar year nor period was associated with LTFU (all P > 0.05; data not shown).

Cross-sectional survey on SHCS participation at cohort institutions

The survey showed that 7424 of 8802 patients (84%) receiving care at institutions of the SHCS network during 2008 were participating in the SHCS. The distribution of geographical region of origin according to cohort status is depicted in Table 3. Nonparticipation (i.e. formerly participating and never having participated in the SHCS) was highest among individuals from sub-Saharan Africa (374 of 1186; 32%), followed by northern Africa/Middle East (28 of 109; 26%), Latin America/Caribbean (74 of 329; 22%), eastern Europe/Central Asia (40 of 182; 22%), southeastern Asia (52 of 283; 18%), northwestern regions (733 of 6054; 12%) and southern Europe (77 of 659; 12%) (P < 0.001). More than half of all former SHCS participants (54%) had been infected via IDU. The proportion of women was higher in those who had never participated (43%) and former participants (42%) than in current SHCS participants (30%).

The proportion of individuals taking ART ranged from 69% in those who had never participated, to 77% in former participants, to 89% in current SHCS participants. In logistic regression models, men from non-European countries were less likely to participate in the SHCS than Europeans [odds ratio (OR) 2.73; 95% CI 2.29–3.24]. ORs for nonparticipation ranged from 2.80 (95% CI 1.73–4.51) for individuals from southeastern Asia, to 5.31 (95% CI 4.14–6.82) for individuals from sub-Saharan Africa. Women from sub-Saharan Africa (OR 3.01; 95% CI 2.40–3.77) and Latin America/Caribbean (OR 2.10; 95% CI 1.30–3.39) were significantly less likely to participate than those from northwestern regions. IDUs were less likely to participate in the SHCS (OR 2.19; 95% CI 1.81–2.64) while receiving ART was significantly associated with SHCS participation (OR 1.83; 95% CI 1.59–2.11).
Immigrants present a substantial and rising proportion of participants in the SHCS. In the present study from 1996 to 2008, 30% of cohort participants originated from non-European countries, with more than half being from sub-Saharan Africa. In women, immigrants accounted for more than half being from sub-Saharan Africa. In 2008, 30% of cohort participants originated from non-European countries, with more than half being from sub-Saharan Africa. In women, immigrants accounted for more than half being from sub-Saharan Africa.

A previous study from the SHCS showed a steady increase in sub-Saharan Africa participants, from 3% (1989–1992) to 12% (1997–2001) [7]. In the present study, we observed a continuation of this trend to 14% (2004–2008). The increase in the proportion of female enrollees in the SHCS was striking: the proportion of individuals from sub-Saharan Africa among women entering the SHCS rose from 19% (1996–1999) to 42% (2004–2008), thus more than doubling. The large proportion of individuals from sub-Saharan Africa among immigrants is not a reflection of a large sub-Saharan African population in Switzerland – they account for only 0.9% of 7.6 million inhabitants of the country [5] – but rather shows the high prevalence of HIV/AIDS in their countries of origin. An increasing proportion of individuals from sub-Saharan Africa in those acquiring HIV infection via heterosexual transmission has also been reported in other European countries: in the UK, more than two-thirds of newly detected HIV infections were among sub-Saharan Africans [16].

Immigrants in the SHCS were younger and had received less education than the local population, findings also reported from Spain [17,18]. People from low-income countries were found to be at increased risk of presenting with AIDS compared with HIV-positive individuals from developed countries [19]. In our study, patients from southeastern Asia enrolled with the most advanced stage of HIV infection. While there is evidence of an increased risk of sub-Saharan Africans presenting late [20,21], there is less awareness of the risk of seropositivity in southeastern Asia migrants [22]. TB as an AIDS-defining infection was found to be most prevalent in sub-Saharan Africa, reflecting the high prevalence of HIV/TB coinfections in African countries, where more than 30% of all new TB cases in adults are estimated to be associated with HIV infection [23]. Hepatitis C virus (HCV) seropositivity correlated with HIV transmission via IDU, and was thus more prevalent in northwestern countries, southern Europe and eastern Europe/Central Asia [24]. Chronic hepatitis B virus (HBV) infection was significantly more prevalent in those from sub-Saharan Africa and southeastern Asia, reflecting the geographical regions with the highest prevalence of HBV infection worldwide [25]. Past or present syphilis was disproportionally high among those from Latin America/Caribbean, a finding in accordance with surveillance data from England [26].

While retaining HIV-infected patients in medical care has been shown to be associated with improved health...
outcomes, data from industrial [8] and developing countries [27] have shown that there are difficulties in patient retention. In our study, the rate of LTFU was 3.76 (95% CI 3.58–3.95)/100 py, which is similar to the 3.72 (95% CI 3.58–3.86)/100 py reported by the EuroSIDA study group [10]. In the SHCS, people originating from regions other than northwestern countries were at risk for LTFU, as shown in the French Hospital Database [11]. Although demographically similar to southeastern Asians, in the present study sub-Saharan Africans had a disproportionately high LTFU. In research on sub-Saharan Africans at one of the SHCS centres [4], it was found that the majority of those who had left the country had been denied asylum. An uncertain legal situation, with the risk of deportation through the asylum process, which has also been described in other countries, is likely to contribute to LTFU [28].

Older participants had a better retention rate, which is in accordance with other recent data [10,11,29]. Older age may be a proxy for less mobility and more comorbidity. Although a large proportion of participants with IDU as the transmission risk in Switzerland have stopped injecting drugs [30], IDU remains an important and independent risk factor for LTFU [10,11,29]. People with a higher baseline CD4 cell count or who were treatment-naïve were more prone to LTFU, a finding in congruence with research from France [29]. However, using time-updated CD4 cell counts for multivariable analyses, it was found that participants more likely to be lost to follow-up were those with lower latest CD4 cell counts. This has been observed in other cohort studies [10,29] in which time-updated CD4 cell counts were applied. Some of these patients may have been less adherent to treatment, or they may have died without documentation in the cohort database.

Immigrants were less likely to participate in the SHCS, with people from sub-Saharan Africa having the greatest probability of nonparticipation. Participating in the SHCS implies written informed consent. Concerns about disclosure could discourage sub-Saharan Africans from signing. Compared with other European countries with high numbers of immigrants, Switzerland has small, fractured immigrant groups that are divided by the barriers of the country’s four different language regions. If immigrants rely on a small community of fellow nationals for support, they might be more inclined to avoid disclosure, fearing to risk their social status [31]. Among sub-Saharan Africans, men were the most vulnerable group for cohort non-participation. This is consistent with findings from African countries showing that men access ART less frequently and at a more advanced stage of HIV infection compared with women [32,33]. In qualitative research among sub-Saharan African migrant communities in the United Kingdom [34], all informants addressed the need to engage more with African men: for socio/cultural reasons they are greater risk-takers and more reluctant to admit a positive HIV status associated with stigma and dependence.

This study has certain limitations. While other research used only surrogate markers for region of origin, we classified regions of origin based on participants’ nationality, which is most frequently used for international comparison at present [35]. However, use of nationality cannot discriminate between those who have immigrant status and those who have adopted Swiss nationality by marriage, which has important social implications. Another limitation is that it was not possible to make regular comprehensive linkages with the national death registry, for legal and technical reasons. With respect to cohort participation, undocumented immigrants do not even seek medical care in the existing network of HIV practitioners. Therefore, the participation bias is probably still underestimated. The strength of the SHCS is its national representativeness. Of note, a recent comparison with sales data from pharmaceutical companies revealed that 75% of the antiretroviral drugs sold in Switzerland from 2006 to 2008 were prescribed to participants in the SHCS [14]. Further, the nationwide network enabled us to assess cohort nonparticipation.

In conclusion, numbers of HIV-infected immigrants are increasing in the SHCS but immigrants are underrepresented in the SHCS, and are more likely to be lost to follow-up. Our data on nonparticipation, ART status and LTFU suggest that quality of care for immigrants may be less optimal, although healthcare insurance for all persons living in Switzerland is mandatory. Thus, qualitative research is needed to analyse underlying reasons for nonparticipation and LTFU of immigrants, also taking into account gender differences. To increase enrolment in the SHCS, enhance adherence to cohort visits and increase ART uptake and adherence to ART, for the benefit of vulnerable groups in Switzerland, and in Europe generally, we propose (i) to motivate immigrants to participate in the cohort and encourage them to remain in the cohort; (ii) to make use of mediators from sub-Saharan Africa with training in the support of people with HIV infection; (iii) to recruit male mediators who are able to follow up African men in a gender-sensitive way; (iv) to obtain information on the structural characteristics of local immigrant communities and enhance the empowerment of immigrants; and (v) to improve the training of Swiss healthcare providers in transcultural competency [36].

Acknowledgements

We are grateful to all participants in the SHCS, and to the care givers, study nurses and data managers. Furthermore, we thank Martin Gebhardt from the Swiss Federal Office of Public Health for discussing HIV surveillance data with us.
Appendix

The members of the Swiss HIV Cohort Study Group are:


Financial support: This study has been financed in the framework of the Swiss HIV Cohort Study, supported by the Swiss National Science Foundation. Further support was provided by an unrestricted educational grant from Gilead. The funding sources had no influence on study design, analysis or writing of the manuscript.

References

23 Corbett EL. HIV and tuberculosis: surveillance revisited. 


